



3 1761 10084081 8

The material reproduced  
herein is intended for  
the sole use of students  
registered in the seminar,  
Children and the Law.

CHILDREN AND THE LAW

edited by

Bernard Green

August 1983



FACULTY OF LAW LIBRARY  
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

The material reproduced  
herein is intended for  
the sole use of students  
registered in the seminar,  
Children and the Law.

CHILDREN AND THE LAW

edited by

Bernard Green

August 1983



Digitized by the Internet Archive  
in 2018 with funding from  
University of Toronto

[https://archive.org/details/childrenlaw00gree\\_6](https://archive.org/details/childrenlaw00gree_6)

I deeply appreciate the contribution of my research assistant, Ian Arellano, a student in this Faculty, to the preparation of this casebook.

The following also assisted in the preparation of the casebook: Teresa Klimushko and Pat Ward.



CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

A. <u>General</u> .....	1
Introduction .....	1
Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms .....	2
Marks, "Detours on the Road to Maturity" .....	5
Moonkin & Coons, "Toward a Theory of Children's Rights" .....	13
Brant, "The Child's Right to Privacy" .....	19
B. <u>Children and Medical Services</u> .....	24
Wadlington, Minors and Health Care .....	24
Globe and Mail .....	30
Landau, Barriers to Consent to Treatment .....	31
Bowker, Minors and Mental Incompetents .....	38
Green & Paul, "Parenthood and the Mentally Retarded" .....	46
Re D .....	51
Globe & Mail .....	54

CHAPTER TWO: CHILD WELFARE LEGISLATION

A. <u>Introduction</u> .....	56
Min. Comm & Soc. Services, The Children's Act .....	57
Ont. Assoc. C.A.S. Response .....	59
Moonkin, "Child-Custody Adjudication: Judicial Functions in the Face of Indeterminacy" .....	62
B. <u>Jurisdiction</u> .....	83
(a) <u>Introduction</u> .....	83
Sypnowich, Society's Child .....	83
(b) <u>Voluntary</u>	
Child Welfare Act .....	92
Min. Comm & Soc. Serv., The Children's Act .....	95
Ont. Assoc. C.A.S., Response .....	114
(c) <u>Involuntary</u>	
Child Welfare Act .....	120
Wald, "State Intervention on Behalf of Neglected Children" .....	123
Ex parte D .....	148
Globe and Mail .....	154
Re C.A.S. Kingston and H and G .....	156
*Re Metro Toronto C.A.S. and Pamela M .....	160

Min. Comm. & Soc. Serv., Children's Act .....	167
Ont. Assoc. (A.S., Response .....	170
<b>C. Process: lawyers and legal rights .....</b>	<b>171</b>
Child Welfare Act .....	171
Dickens, "The Child in the Courts" .....	178
<u>Re W</u> .....	203
<u>Re C</u> .....	206
Re C.A.S. Kingston and H and G .....	213
Min. Comm & Soc. Serv. Children's Act .....	214
<b>D. Disposition .....</b>	<b>215</b>
(a) <b>Process: experts and prediction .....</b>	<b>215</b>
Child Welfare Act .....	215
Dershowitz, "On 'Preventive Detention'".....	218
Sypnowich, Society's Child .....	226
(b) <b>Power .....</b>	<b>238</b>
Child Welfare Act .....	238
<u>Re C.A.S. Kingston and H and G</u> .....	240
<u>Re W.P.D.W.</u> .....	242
<u>Hansen v. Hamilton C.A.S.</u> .....	246
Ministry of Community and Social Services, "Foster Care" .....	250
Min. Comm & Soc. Serv., Children's Act .....	261
(c) <b>Reviews .....</b>	<b>264</b>
Child Welfare Act .....	264
Note, "The Custody Question and Child Neglect Rehearings" .....	267
<u>Re Cordes-Saathoff et al and C.C.A.S. of Metro Toronto</u> .....	273
Min. Comm. & Soc. Serv., Children's Act .....	276
Child Welfare Act .....	277
<b>E. Child Abuse .....</b>	<b>277</b>
(a) <b>The statutory framework .....</b>	<b>278</b>
Criminal Code .....	280
(b) <b>Reasonable force</b>	
<u>Haberstock</u> .....	284
<u>Sarwer-Fower</u> .....	287
<u>Baptiste</u> .....	290
(c) <b>The nature of child abuse .....</b>	<b>292</b>
Greenland, "Child Abuse in Ontario" .....	292
Zigler, "Controlling Child Abuse in America" .....	301

(d) <u>State intervention</u> .....	307
Schucter, Child Abuse Intervention .....	307
Globe and Mail .....	311
Greenland, "Child Abuse in Ontario" .....	313
Helfer, "Why Most Physicians Don't Get Involved in Child Abuse Cases" .....	320
<u>CHAPTER THREE: JUVENILE DELINQUENCY</u>	
A. <u>Introduction</u> .....	325
President's Comm. on Law Enforcement and Admin. of Justice .....	326
Task force Report: Juvenile Delinquency and Youth Crime	
B. <u>The Legislation</u> .....	335
(1) <u>Canada</u> .....	335
<u>Juvenile Delinquents Act and Young Offenders Act</u> .....	335
Min of Comm. & Soc. Services, <u>The Children's Act</u> .....	362
(2) <u>Sweden</u> .....	374
Bolin, Measures to Combat Juvenile .....	374
Delinquency in Sweden	
C. <u>The Issues</u> .....	390
(1) <u>Process: The Charter of Rights</u> .....	390
C.B. v Kimelman .....	390
Re Southam Inc. and the Queen .....	393
Rv S.B. .....	402
Reg v M .....	406
Reg v W .....	414
(2) <u>Waiver</u> .....	420
Reg v M.K. .....	420
Re CRW .....	426
Green, The Disposition of Juvenile Offence .....	430
D. <u>Diversion</u> .....	440
Rojek and Erickson, "Reforming and Juvenile Justice System" .....	440
E. <u>Resources</u> .....	447
Sub-Committee Report on the Constitution of Committee on the Judiciary .....	447
Ministry of Community and Social Services, "Foster Care" .....	453



CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTIONA. GeneralIntroduction

In ordinary usage, "children" can refer to two different groups: one group characterized by age, the other by a legal relationship between the child and another person, his or her parent.

Our society has determined that a person does not have complete legal rights until he or she has reached a certain age. In this province, by the Age of Majority and Accountability Act, R.S.O. 1980, c. 7, a person is vested with full legal capacity at age 18. The eighteen-year-old can vote, marry without parental consent, enter into contracts, etc. But he or she cannot obtain a drink legally in any bar in Ontario until the following year.

Fixing the age for majority at 18 does not answer many questions: (1) At what age shall we allow young people to drive? To leave school? At what age should a person be fully responsible before the criminal law? (2) Does whatever answer you or society gives answer the question, at what age a person should be allowed to obtain an abortion?

Your answer to the last question may be affected by the second meaning that "children" has, i.e., a legal relationship between the "child" and another person, his or her parent. In our society, the legal relationship is normally a product of biology: a parent-child relationship is created as a result of a man and a woman entering into a relationship which produced a child. The usual non-biological method of creating the parent-child relationship is by adoption. See Part IV of the Child Welfare Act, R.S.O. 1980, c. 66.

The issues we explore in this seminar involve basic problems of political philosophy. More particularly, we are concerned with the allocation of power between the state, the parents and the child. The historical background is provided in the article by Marks, "Detours on the Road to Maturity," (reproduced below); the basic issues are posed in the article by Mnookin and Coons, "Toward a Theory of Children's Rights," (reproduced below). We focus on one specific problem, that of minor's consent to medical procedures.

The response of the legal system to issues involving children may be affected by the introduction into Canadian law of the Charter of Rights and Freedoms, reproduced below.

CHAPTER TWO: CHILD WELFARE LEGISLATIONA. Introduction

Every jurisdiction in North America has legislation that authorizes the state to intervene in the life of the family by removing the child from his or her home if certain conditions are satisfied. Ontario is no exception. The Child Welfare Act, although revised very recently, betrays its nineteenth century origins; see, for example, s. 19(1).

Among the questions you should consider are the following:

- (1) In what circumstances is the state justified in removing the child from his home? (2) Should this decision be based on a cost-benefit analysis - i.e., if the costs (to whom?) outweigh the benefits (to whom?), should the state refuse to intervene? (3) Is it possible to determine the costs and benefits? (See Mnookin, "Child-Custody Adjudication," reproduced herein.) (4) Is the state concerned about the present situation, or is it really concerned about the future consequences of the present situation? (5) If the latter, do we have an accurate means of predicting future human behaviour? (See Dershowitz, "On Preventive Detention," reproduced herein.)

CHAPTER THREE: JUVENILE DELINQUENCYA. Introduction

Every (Western) society has had to decide how it will handle persons who are not adults when they have engaged in criminal activity. The responses have taken two basic forms: (1) The North American: on this continent, we have established specialized courts with a special process and special dispositional powers to deal with part of this group. (See the Young Offenders Act, reproduced below. In conjunction with the Young Offenders Act, we have reproduced its predecessor, the Juvenile Delinquents Act. We have done so because the Young Offenders Act has not yet been proclaimed; the cases we reproduce were decided under the Juvenile Delinquents Act.) Those who are above the maximum age for juvenile court jurisdiction are subject to the ordinary process, i.e., trial in adult criminal court.

(2) In some European countries, young people who would be processed in juvenile court in Canada are handled by the ordinary child welfare system. Note that in these countries, too, there is a gap. Thus, in Sweden, the age of criminal responsibility is 15 and anyone 15 years of age or older can be tried in the ordinary criminal courts. See "Measures to Combat Juvenile Delinquency in Sweden," paragraphs 21-24, reproduced below.

